

High Species Turnover and Decreasing Plant Species Richness on Mountain Summits in Sweden: Reindeer Grazing Overrides Climate Change? Reply

Authors: Jon Moen, and Anna Lagerström

Source: Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research, 41(1) : 152

Published By: Institute of Arctic and Alpine Research (INSTAAR), University of Colorado

URL: <https://doi.org/10.1657/1523-0430-41.1.152>

BioOne Complete (complete.BioOne.org) is a full-text database of 200 subscribed and open-access titles in the biological, ecological, and environmental sciences published by nonprofit societies, associations, museums, institutions, and presses.

Your use of this PDF, the BioOne Complete website, and all posted and associated content indicates your acceptance of BioOne's Terms of Use, available at www.bioone.org/terms-o-use.

Usage of BioOne Complete content is strictly limited to personal, educational, and non - commercial use. Commercial inquiries or rights and permissions requests should be directed to the individual publisher as copyright holder.

BioOne sees sustainable scholarly publishing as an inherently collaborative enterprise connecting authors, nonprofit publishers, academic institutions, research libraries, and research funders in the common goal of maximizing access to critical research.

High Species Turnover and Decreasing Plant Species Richness on Mountain Summits in Sweden: Reindeer Grazing Overrides Climate Change? Reply

Jon Moen* and
Anna Lagerström†

*Corresponding author: Department of Ecology and Environmental Science, Umeå University, SE-901 87 Umeå, Sweden
jon.moen@emg.umu.se

†Department of Forest Ecology and Management, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences, SE-901 83 Umeå, Sweden

DOI: 10.1657/1938-4246(2008-1)[REPLY]2.0.CO;2

The papers cited by Kullman (2008) in his comment (some of which we were unaware of at the time of writing our paper) raise an important issue in any revisitation study, namely the comparability of studies. To recapitulate, we (Moen and Lagerström, 2008) found a significantly reduced species richness since the 1950s (Kilander, 1955) on eight out of nine visited mountain summits, while Kullman (2007) found increased species richness on two of those summits 2 years later. Kullman suggested that the difference in species richness between our and his studies lies in sampling dates. This is an interesting hypothesis that, of course, can be tested. However, neither he nor we presented data with which to evaluate this. We based our sampling scheme on previous experiences with mid to high alpine vegetation (e.g. Moen, 1993; Virtanen et al., 1997), where we have seen plants initiating growth immediately after (or even before) snowmelt. High altitude vegetation has a well-adapted phenology to the short growing season, and almost all species are perennial. Thus, we reasoned that the important criterion to base our sampling on was that there were no remaining snow patches at our sites, which would make it difficult to find species. Kilander (1955) himself visited the mountains between 4 July and 31 August on different mountains and in different years, but we do not know at which dates he visited the mountain summits. Kullman further suggested that invading species from lower altitudes have a different phenology and that they cannot be seen until late in the season. This is of course possible, and it raises important questions for future plant community dynamics as both current vegetation and invading species may be out of phase with the prevailing climate. Other differences between our study and that of Kilander's (and that of Kullman's), which we discussed in our paper, were single-year vs. multiple-year observations and differences in sampling area and effort.

Finally, we would like to point out that one of the most interesting results in our study was not changes in species richness *per se* but the high turnover of species caused by species- and mountain-specific responses. For instance, many species had

disappeared from some mountain summits and appeared on others when we compared our data set with Kilander's. These observations concern species commonly found at these altitudes, and which should be adapted to the length of the growing season. None of the species were so called "forest species" *sensu* Kullman (2008). These results should thus not be sensitive to phenological differences between sampling dates.

References Cited

- Kilander, S., 1955: Kärleväxternas övre gränser på fjäll i sydvästra Jämtland samt angränsande delar av Härjedalen och Norge [Upper limits of vascular plants on mountains in southwestern Jämtland and adjacent parts of Härjedalen (Sweden) and Norway]. *Acta Phytogeographica Suecica*, 35: 1–198 (In Swedish with English summary).
- Kullman, L., 2007: Long-term geobotanical observations of climate change impacts in the Scandes of west-central Sweden. *Nordic Journal of Botany*, 24: 445–467.
- Kullman, L., 2008: High species turnover and decreasing plant species richness on mountain summits in Sweden: reindeer grazing overrides climate change? Comment. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*, 41: 151.
- Moen, J., 1993: Positive versus negative interactions in a high alpine fellfield: germination of *Oxyria digyna* seeds in a *Ranunculus glacialis* community. *Arctic and Alpine Research*, 25: 201–206.
- Moen, J., and Lagerström, A., 2008: High species turnover and decreasing plant species richness on mountain summits in Sweden: reindeer grazing overrides climate change? *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*, 40: 382–395.
- Virtanen, R. J., Lundberg, P. A., Moen, J., and Oksanen, L., 1997: Topographic and altitudinal patterns in plant communities on European arctic islands. *Polar Biology*, 17: 95–113.

MS accepted November 2008