

The Utility of Desmidiospora: A Paradigm Shift Based on Paleogene Fungal Remains from the Ñirihuau Basin, Argentina

Authors: Bianchinotti, M. Virginia, Martínez, Marcelo A., and Cornou, M. Elina

Source: Palynology, 44(4) : 587-596

Published By: AASP: The Palynological Society

URL: https://doi.org/10.1080/01916122.2019.1657514

BioOne Complete (complete.BioOne.org) is a full-text database of 200 subscribed and open-access titles in the biological, ecological, and environmental sciences published by nonprofit societies, associations, museums, institutions, and presses.

Your use of this PDF, the BioOne Complete website, and all posted and associated content indicates your acceptance of BioOne's Terms of Use, available at <u>www.bioone.org/terms-of-use</u>.

Usage of BioOne Complete content is strictly limited to personal, educational, and non - commercial use. Commercial inquiries or rights and permissions requests should be directed to the individual publisher as copyright holder.

BioOne sees sustainable scholarly publishing as an inherently collaborative enterprise connecting authors, nonprofit publishers, academic institutions, research libraries, and research funders in the common goal of maximizing access to critical research.



Check for updates

The utility of *Desmidiospora*: a paradigm shift based on Paleogene fungal remains from the Nirihuau Basin, Argentina

M. Virginia Bianchinotti^a (D), Marcelo A. Martínez^b and M. Elina Cornou^b

^aCentro de Recursos Naturales Renovables de la Zona Semiárida (CERZOS-CONICET), Departamento de Biología, Bioquímica y Farmacia, Universidad Nacional del Sur (UNS), Bahía Blanca, Argentina; ^bInstituto Geológico del Sur (INGEOSUR-CONICET), Departamento de Geología, Universidad Nacional del Sur (UNS), Bahía Blanca, Argentina

ABSTRACT

Fungal remains similar to those described as *Desmidiospora willoughbyi* were found in samples from the Río Foyel section (El Foyel Group of Paleogene age), Nirihuau Basin, Argentina. A full description and illustrations are presented. The names *D. willoughbyi* and *D. marginiconvoluta* as defined are shown to be inadequate. The history of the names and actual affinity of taxa presently assigned to those names are discussed. Arguments against the use of *Desmidiospora* for fungal remains other than the conidia of an entomopathogenic species are presented. Instead, the lobulate fossil remains should be treated as germlings or immature ascomata from epiphyllous fungi of polyphyletic origin.

KEYWORDS

Desmidiospora; epiphyllous fungal remains; Ñirihuau Basin; Paleogene; Argentina

1. Introduction

The frequency of fungal remains in palynological samples is highly variable. In Quaternary sediments they can be abundant and are generally easily recognised, and many can be assigned to extant genera. This move towards application of modern fungal morphological taxonomy and away from form-genera has won more followers, as this method of identification makes it easier to establish a robust palaeoecological signal based upon modern fungal ecological tolerances, rather than assuming that the fungal signal, by proxy, is mirroring that of plant and algal palynomorphs (Kalgutkar 1997; O'Keefe 2017).

The value of fungal palynomorphs for the Holocene is indisputable, as they are recognised and widely used as palaeoenvironmental proxies. However, for pre-Quaternary palynological studies the situation is quite different. Pirozynski (1976) and Kalgutkar and Jansonius (2000) presented a short but detailed review of the history of palaeomycology, which was greatly expanded by Taylor et al. (2015). Interest in the discipline has been cyclical, being very active in the earliest days of palynology (late 1800s), largely forgotten, then reinstated in the 1960s and now revalued and growing, although fungi are still only sporadically cited in deep-time fossil samples, mostly as indeterminate remains or as taxa with open assignations, and they are seldom studied in depth. Throughout the history of palaeomycology, researchers have doubted its usefulness because it is not possible to refer all fossil fungi convincingly to modern analogues (Pirozynski 1976; Kalgutkar and Jansonius 2000; Taylor et al. 2015). For this reason, the value of fungi as palaeoenvironmental indicators could be considered limited, even though their biostratigraphical value is important (Elsik 1980, 1992; Norris 1986; Kalgutkar and Braman 2008), especially in early Cenozoic studies, where their evolution is closely linked to the diversification of the angiosperms (Traverse 2007). The problem increases with the massive introduction of morphogenera (ending in -ites), many of which are redundant, and few of which take asexual morphs into account (Pirozynski 1976). This issue was recognised early on (O'Keefe 2017), and now this trend is in reverse (Hawksworth et al. 2016; Nuñez Otaño et al. 2017; Shumilovskikh et al. 2017; Pound et al. 2018), but there are still many fossil taxa to review and discuss. With the introduction of the 'one fungus, one name' concept in fungal nomenclature and the removal of protections for multiple names for dispersed fossil parts of single organisms with the Melbourne Code (Hawksworth 2011), these reviews must be undertaken with care to avoid violations of the International Code of Nomenclature (ICN) (Turland et al. 2018).

The discovery of remains that matched those commonly identified as *Desmidiospora willoughbyi* faced us with the dilemma of using a well-known and accepted but erroneous name or trying to resolve a nomenclatural problem. Here we present a full description along with a thorough discussion of the validity of the name and arguments for avoiding its use in the future.

2. Geological setting

The Ñirihuau Basin is located in the western part of Río Negro and Chubut provinces, Argentina (Figure 1). The general stratigraphical column of the Ñirihuau Basin is

CONTACT M. Virginia Bianchinotti vi vbianchi@uns.edu.ar vi Centro de Recursos Naturales Renovables de la Zona Semiárida (CERZOS-CONICET), Departamento de Biología, Bioquímica y Farmacia, Universidad Nacional del Sur (UNS), Bahía Blanca, Argentina.



Figure 1. Location map of the Nirihuau Basin with the position of the Río Foyel section indicated (modified from Cornou et al. 2014).

comprised, from the base to the top, of the Huitrera Formation (Ravazzoli and Sesana 1977) or its lateral equivalent the Cerro Bastión Formation (Diez and Zubia 1981), the El Foyel Group (Asensio et al. 2005), and the Nahuel Huapi Group (González Bonorino 1973; González Bonorino and González Bonorino 1978). The type section of the El Foyel Group (Figure 2), at the Rio Foyel section (41°44′S, 71°30′W), is exposed in the middle valley of the river of the same name, about 80 km south of Lago Nahuel Huapi. This group consists, from the base to top, of the Troncoso (Asensio et al. 2005), Salto del Macho (Asensio et al. 2005), and Río Foyel formations (Pöthe de Baldis 1984). Together, these formations are a 2000 m thick section of volcaniclastics, thick siliciclastics, and minor limestones outcropping along the Foyel River.

The stratigraphical ordering of the formations that make up the El Foyel Group and their age are still controversial. Here we follow the proposal of Asensio et al. (2005) which



Figure 2. The Rio Foyel section and the distribution of studied samples (adapted from Martínez et al. 2016).

was reinforced by several palynological studies (Cornou 2012; Quattrocchio et al. 2012; Cornou et al. 2014; Martínez et al. 2016). The Río Foyel section overlies volcanics from the Cerro Bastión Formation (Middle Eocene), although this contact is obscured by the dense forest cover characteristic of the area. The basal unit corresponds to the Troncoso Formation (Middle to Upper Eocene), which is about 800 m

of immature green sandstones with intercalations of tuffaceous shales and red shales. The Salto del Macho Formation (Middle Eocene–Lower Oligocene) overlies the Troncoso Formation with a sharp erosive contact. This unit is composed of thick beds of polymictic conglomerate with a maximum thickness of 560 m and with thinner layers of sandstone and intercalations of black shales and ignimbrites. The section ends with the lowermost part of the Río Foyel Formation (Oligocene) which is approximately 600 m in thickness, and composed mostly of black shales, with some intercalations of bioclastic limestone and conglomerate.

3. Materials and methods

Four outcrop samples of siltstone and shales from the Troncoso and Salto del Macho Formations in the El Foyel Group at the Rio Foyel section (Figure 2) were found to contain Desmidiospora-types and related fungi during the course of a study of fungal spores (Martínez et al. 2016). Fungal remains were extracted from the rocks using mineral-acid palynological techniques involving treatments with hydrochloric and hydrofluoric acids (Volkheimer and Melendi 1976). The slides were examined using a transmitted light microscope (Olympus BX40A) equipped with an Olympus CAMEDIA C-5060 digital camera. Slides are housed in the Universidad Nacional del Sur-Instituto Geológico del Sur, Bahía Blanca, Buenos Aires province, Argentina. They are identified by the abbreviation UNSP (Universidad Nacional del Sur, Palynology) and a catalogue number followed by letters denoting each formation: T (Troncoso), SM (Salto del Macho) or RF (Rio Foyel). Specimen locations on sample slides are noted with England Finder coordinates.

Fungal germlings were classified and described following Lange (1976). Neither the germlings nor the ascomata illustrated here are formally designated, since they will be treated in a future publication, along with other thyriothecia recovered from the El Foyel Group.

4. Results

Hofmann (2010) presented a schematic reconstruction of the life cycle of an Asterina species to exemplify those of microthyriaceous-like fungi. Following the diagram presented in Hofmann's thesis (2010), we selected some of the fossil materials recovered from our samples and tried to relate them to the stages of the life cycle (Figure 3). The hypothetical life cycle begins with the germination of ascospores (Figure 3a-b; Plate 1, figures 7, 10 - white arrows), to develop surface hyphae with appresoria (Figure 3c; Plate 1, figures 6, 8 - black arrow and arrowhead). When conditions are favourable, the formation of the reproductive sexual body is initiated; the immature stages of the development of ascoma are also termed germlings (Figure 3d-e; Plate 1, figures 1–4, 8 – arrow). The mature ascoma (Figure 3f), called the thyriothecium, is delta-shaped in lateral view (Plate 1, figure 11) and has a circular outline in surface view. The thick scutellum (upper ascomatal wall) is the structure that is best preserved and most frequently recovered from palynological



Figure 3. Hypothetical reconstruction of the life cycle of microthyriaceous-like fungi based on the observations of Hofmann (2010), redrawn from fossil specimens recovered from the Paleogene of the Nirihuau Basin (not to scale). (a–b) Ascospore germinating. (c) Surface hyphae with appresoria. (d–e) Immature stages of the development of ascoma (germlings). (f) Mature ascomata in lateral view.

samples (Plate 1, figures 5, 9). Our materials, consisting of germlings (specimens 1 to 3) and ascomata (specimens 4 to 8), are described and illustrated (Plate 1).

Specimens 1-3

Plate 1, figures 1-3

Three specimens of dispersed germlings were recovered in this study from the Troncoso and Salto del Macho formations.

Material

UNSP-T 2223b: L19/4 (Plate 1, figure 1); UNSP-T 2223f: J24/2 (Plate 1, figure 2); UNSP-SM 3152c: A17/3 (Plate 1, figure 3).

Description

Flattened, circular, elliptical to irregular in outline, scarcely to deeply lobate. Wall smooth, *ca.* $1 \mu m$ thick, light to dark brown. The distinctive lobes are separated by invaginations which occur in radial sets of differing lengths.

Dimensions

 $22\times28\,\mu m,~20\times20\,\mu m,~30\times41\,\mu m.$ Range of dimensions, width: 20(24)30 $\mu m,$ length: 20(30)41 $\mu m.$

Remarks

Our specimens resemble those described from the Upper Eocene in southern New Zealand by Conran et al. (2016, fig. 2T) and Bannister et al. (2016, fig. 4I); however, ours are much larger than those examples. Each meets the current diagnosis for *Desmidiospora willoughbyi*. They correspond to the 'Grade V germlings' in Lange (1976). In Quaternary palynology these may also be recognised as HDV-13 (van Geel 1978).

Specimen 4

Plate 1, figure 4

Material

UNSP-SM 2987b: Q53.

Description

Ascoma immature, flattened, sub-circular in outline. Wall smooth, *ca*. 1 μ m thick, medium brown. Radial and transverse septa produce an imperfect reticulum. A remnant of dark brown, septate hypha of *ca*. 4 μ m in width is recognised (Plate 1, figure 4 – black arrow).

Dimensions

 $24 \times 30 \,\mu m$.

Remarks

This material could be associated with early stages of development of ascomata, like those illustrated in Hofmann and Piepenbring (2006). This specimen resembles immature stages of *Phragmothyrites concentricus* Carlie J. Phipps & Rember (Phipps and Rember 2004, fig. 2). In Quaternary sediments it may also be recognised as HDV-8A-e (van Geel 1978).

Specimen 5

Plate 1, figures 5-8



Plate 1. Figures 1–3. Germlings; Figure 1. UNSP-T 2223b: L19/4; Figure 2. UNSP-T 2223f: J24/2; Figure 3. UNSP-SM 3152c: A17/3. Figure 4. Immature ascomata, UNSP-SM 2987b: Q53, dark brown septate hyphae (arrow). Figures 5–8. Specimen 5, in general view (figure 5) and details (figures 6–8) showing mature thyriothecia, young ascoma, spore, mycelium and hyphopodia, UNSP-SM 3154c: V37/3; Figure 6. initial stages of the development of the thyriothecia (arrow), similar to the one illustrated by Hofmann (2010, p. 294, fig. 4.4); Figure 7. detail of mycelium and 1-septate spore (white arrow); Figure 8. detail of young ascoma (arrow) and hyphopodia (arrowhead); Figure 9. Specimen 6, showing mature thyriothecia, young ascoma (arrow) and hyphopodia (arrowhead); Figure 9. Specimen 6, showing mature thyriothecia, young ascoma (arrow) and hyphopodia (arrowhead), UNSP-SM 3154c: C24/1; Figure 10. a young ascoma beneath a fragmented thyriothecium (arrow), 2-septate spore (white arrow), germinating through each of its three cells and a hook-like appressorium (arrowhead), similar to that illustrated in Vishnu et al. (2017); Figure 11. mature thyriothecium in lateral view showing the black neck (arrow), UNSP-T 2223b: N56/2. Scale bars: 1–4, 6–8, 10 = 10 µm; 5, 9, 11 = 20 µm.

Material

UNSP-SM 3154c: V37/3.

Description

Thyriothecia roughly polygonal, margin irregular, ostiolate (Plate 1, figure 5). Ostiole circular, up to 20 μ m in diameter, internally surrounded by brown denticulate cells of up to 4 μ m in height. Wall comprising four rows of cells, radiating from the centre, more or less quadrangular around the ostiole, and branched in an irregularly dichotomised pattern around the periphery. In close proximity with the mature ascoma, a young one, *ca.* 25 μ m diameter (Plate 1, figures 5, 8 – black arrows), one 1-septate spore, 11 × 19 μ m (Plate 1, figure 7 – white arrow), some hyphopodia (Plate 1, figures 5, 8 – black arrowheads, figure 6 – black arrow), and abundant mycelium (hyphae 4–11 μ m wide) can be recognised.

Dimensions

Diameter: 80 \times 87 $\mu m.$

Remarks

No thickening zone around the ostiole is observed in this specimen. These materials exemplify a growth continuum for a single taxon that taken individually would be assigned to several taxa. The mature ascoma illustrated in Plate 1, figure 5 would be assigned to *Trichothyrites denticulatus* (Ramanujam & K.P. Rao) Kalgutkar & Janson., and the material illustrated in Plate 1, figures 6–8 could be identified as *Ascodesmisites malayensis* Trivedi, Chaturv. & C.L. Verma.

Specimen 6

Plate 1, figure 9

Material

UNSP-SM 3154c: C24/1.

Description

Thyriothecia subcircular, medium orange-brown. Upper wall comprising up to five rows of more or less rectangular cells, radiating from the centre, and branched at the margin, thick-ened and strongly crenulate, forming a darkened rim of up to 4 μ m wide. Ostiole central, *ca*. 13 μ m in diameter, surrounded by a thickened and darkened zone *ca*. 5 μ m wide, formed by two rows of darkened cells. Internally to the ostiole, subhyaline cells can be recognised with a radial arrangement, giving the opening a star-shaped outline. Connected with the thyriothecia, several hyphae of medium brown colour, an initial of an ascoma around 20 μ m in diameter (Plate 1, figure 9 – black arrow), and two probable dark brown hyphopodia, of 7 × 19 μ m and 7 × 11 μ m, are recognised (Plate 1, figure 9 – black arrowhead).

Dimensions

Maximum diameter: 74 µm.

Remarks

This specimen would be also assigned to *Trichothyrites denticulatus*.

Specimen 7

Plate 1, figure 10

Material

UNSP-SM 3154c: Y15/1.

Description

A young ascoma (Plate 1, figure 10 – black arrow) is recognised beneath a fragmented, more or less rounded, thyriothecium. In close proximity a 2-septate spore (Plate 1, figure 10 – white arrow) is distinguished, germinating through each of its three cells. A hook-like appressorium, similar to that illustrated in Vishnu et al. (2017), is recognised on one of the hyphae (Plate 1, figure 10 – black arrowhead).

Dimensions

Spore: $9 \times 14 \ \mu\text{m}$, hyphae up to $4 \ \mu\text{m}$ wide, initial of ascoma 25 $\ \mu\text{m}$ in diameter.

Remarks

This specimen is similar to *Ascodesmisites malayensis* figured in Kalgutkar and Jansonius (2000, pl. 34, fig. 7).

Specimen 8

Plate 1, figure 11

Material

UNSP-T 2223b: N56/2.

Description

Thyriothecia medium to dark brown, triangular in lateral view, irregular in outline and ostiolate, with a black neck of $5 \,\mu\text{m}$ in height (Plate 1, figure 11 – black arrow). Around the ostiole, a darkened zone of around $30 \,\mu\text{m}$ in diameter can be clearly recognised.

Dimensions

Thyriothecia $60 \,\mu\text{m}$ in height, $110 \,\mu\text{m}$ in width, ostiole *ca*. $10 \,\mu\text{m}$ in diameter.

Remarks

This is a mature ascoma shown in lateral view. It resembles the schematic figure shown in Ellis (1977, fig. 9A) of the extant *Trichothyrina salicis* Ellis. In Quaternary sediments it may also be recognised as HDV-8B-d (van Geel 1978).

5. Discussion

Ascomycetes growing on the surface of plants are collectively known as epiphyllous fungi. The group is polyphyletic as it contains members of distantly related orders such as the Asterinales and Meliolales (Hongsanan et al. 2016). Alvin and Muir (1970) described an epiphyllous fungus from the Lower Cretaceous in the Isle of Wight, UK, considering it to be the oldest member of the order Microthyriales. Recently, García Massini et al. (2012) described several specimens from the Jurassic in Argentina, which are now considered the earliest fossil records of epiphyllous fungi (Taylor et al. 2015). Hongsanan et al. (2016) analysed data from sequences and molecular clock calibration and then estimated the evolution of the group to have occurred as early as the Permian. However, it is not until the Cretaceous when records of these fungi become common; consequently, they are considered to be valuable indicators of age and ecological conditions (e.g. Smith 1980; Traverse 2007; Taylor et al. 2015).

From palynological samples of sedimentary rocks of the Nirihuau Basin (Middle Eocene–Oligocene), we recovered a high concentration of remains that are very similar morphologically to the modern epiphyllous ascomycetes, mainly to members of the Asterinales and Microthyriales. Among them are fungal structures commonly assigned to *Desmidiospora willoughbyi*. The easiest solution would have been to use this name in the same way that it has been used repeatedly in palynological studies, but as we found several discrepancies in the literature, the question arose as to what precisely is meant by *Desmidiospora willoughbyi*.

The genus *Desmidiospora* was established by Thaxter (1891) for a single, entomopathogenic species. The fungus, named *Desmidiospora myrmecophila*, was found growing on the queen of the cosmopolitan ant *Camponotus*. Its distinguishing character was the huge brown macroconidia (up to $100 \,\mu$ m) which were described as dichotomously lobulate. This odd species, closely related to the entomopathogenic genus *Ophiocordyceps* Petch, is rare, and since it was originally described it has only been collected occasionally, although it is presently known from three continents (Evans and Samson 1984; Clark and Prusso 1986; Saltamachia 2018).

In 1967, Bradley described lobulated structures from Eocene samples as the sporangia of a chytrid genus, naming them *Entophlyctis willoughbyi*. Pirozynski (1976, p. 243) criticised Bradley's assignation of those forms to the Chytridiales, saying they 'resemble developing fructifications and juvenile conidiophores of certain leaf-litter hyphomycetes, or appressoria of, for example, *Gaeumannomyces*'.

Ethridge Glass et al. (1986) found similar structures while they were studying Upper Eocene lignites from the Manning Formation. They believed they were the same as those Bradley (1967) had described. These structures had been previously noticed by Edwards (1922), Dilcher (1965), Lange and Smith (1971, 1975) and Elsik and Dilcher (1974) who considered them to be non-conidial fungal propagules. Although some of these contributions were mentioned by Ethridge Glass et al. (1986), the fact that the structures had no septae led them to conclude that the materials had a strong similarity to the macroconidia of *Desmidiospora*. Although they were not associated with ants and they were significantly smaller than the macroconidia of *D. myrmecophila*, Ethridge Glass et al. (1986) believed that the material had enough similarities to create a new combination, *Desmidiospora* *willoughbyi*. Kalgutkar (1997) went further and described a third fossil species, *D. marginiconvoluta*, from the Paleogene of Canada.

From Ethridge Glass et al. (1986) to now, this epithet has been widely used to name fungal remains in palynological samples with similar lobulate morphology (e.g. Kalgutkar 1993, 1997; Norris 1997; Parsons 2000; Ramírez 2004; Traverse 2007; Ratanasthien et al. 2008; García Massini and Jacobs 2011; Shumilovskikh et al. 2015; Silva et al. 2015). Even when several authors identified them as germlings (viz. Romero and Castro 1986; Ediger and Allişan 1989; Head 1993; Conran et al. 2016), the use of *D. willoughbyi* and its description as a spore have prevailed, generating greater confusion. As examples of intermediate positions, García Massini and Jacobs (2011) use the name '*Desmidiospora* propagules' whereas Bannister et al. (2016) do not use the name *D. willoughbyi* but describe the structures as spores.

In our opinion, Desmidiospora must be considered a monotypic genus, restricted to entomopathogenic fungi, that could be merged with Ophiocordyceps, as suggested by Saltamachia (2018). This opinion is shared by Wilk et al. (2012); however, they proposed the creation of a separate form genus in which to place the current D. willoughbyi and D. marginiconvoluta. We strongly disagree with the erection of a new form genus on two grounds: (i) no new information about the taxa would be generated (Seifert 2017); and (ii) the creation of such form genera would only introduce more nomenclatural and systematic chaos, and indeed would violate the 'one fungus one name' precept of the current ICN for algae, fungi, and plants (Hawksworth 2011; Wingfield et al. 2012; Turland et al. 2018). Therefore, we think it is time that a formal proposal to dismiss both D. willoughbyi Ethridge Glass, Brown and Elsik 1986 and D. marginiconvoluta Kalgutkar 1997 should be drafted and submitted to IMA Fungus.

We agree with Conran et al. (2016) that many materials named under these taxa represent immature forms of Microthyriaceae, so they should be considered thyriothecium propagules. In the case of *D. marginiconvoluta*, it is morphologically the same as the forms ranked as Types I–II by Lange (1976). We also agree with van Geel (1978) and Wilk et al. (2012) that others do not seem to be immature microthyriaceous ascomata. Therefore, as these elements are part of the life cycle of epiphyllous fungi belonging to different families, a proper assignation to a definite, single species is not possible for them. For the purposes of palaeoecology, until such time as proper assignations can be made, employing Lange types or lab codes (Miola 2012) as operational taxonomic units may be useful.

Regardless of taxonomic placement, these forms may still provide important information about past ecological conditions. They are known from *Sphagnum* and *Polytrichum* leaves in bogs, are ubiquitous in Cenozoic lignite samples and are known as dispersed particles in siliciclastic sediments (van Geel 1978; Kalgutkar 1997; Wilk et al. 2012), and thus may be indicative of humid, wet conditions.

Several researchers (Dilcher 1965; Lange and Smith 1971; Lange 1978, 1980; Smith 1984; Wells and Hill 1993) considered them useful indicators for palaeoenvironmental reconstruction based on similarities to modern epiphyllous fungi. Lange (1976) made a comprehensive comparison between fossil germlings and their living equivalents on leaflitter from Australasia and assigned the various types to precipitation ranges. Smith (1984) employed Lange's types and their frequencies in fossil cuticles and palynological samples from British Paleogene strata to infer wet palaeoclimatic conditions. Conran et al. (2016) used the same approach to perform a detailed study of fungal fossils associated with angiosperm leaves recovered from a Late Eocene New Zealand rain forest and to make inferences about climate. The application of Lange's categories combined with an analysis of leaf physiognomy allowed them to reinforce their subtropical, ever-wet and humid palaeoclimatic interpretation. In all cases, the abundance of higher grade of germlings (Type IV–V) seems to be a better indicator of high rainfall/humidity conditions than of a latitudinal temperature gradient.

Regardless of how germlings are used to perform palaeoclimatic interpretations, all authors agree that their utility is greater and the most reliable inferences are made when these structures are found associated with the host cuticle. When they are recovered only from palynological samples, a multi-proxy analysis should be performed.

6. Conclusions

The study of Paleogene fungal remains recovered from outcrop samples of the El Foyel Group, Argentina, led us to conclude that the lobulate remains found in palynological samples and frequently identified as *Desmidiospora* in fact represent part of the life cycle of at least two different groups of epiphyllous ascomycetes; thus, *Desmidiospora* as presently defined is strongly polyphyletic in origin.

We propose that fungal remains of this kind should be maintained in an open assignation and treated as germlings. This criterion attempts to bring nomenclatural order to the assignment of these structures, which have recognised palaeoecological utility during the Cenozoic.

Despite the overrated importance that palynologists assign to formal names, a confusing, inaccurate or dubious assignation can lead to erroneous ecological inferences. The recognition of the function or the role a structure plays in a biological cycle is more valuable than the name itself where a reliable assignation cannot be made, and therefore more reliable palaeoenvironmental and palaeoclimatic reconstructions can be obtained.

Acknowledgements

We strongly thank Jennifer O'Keefe and one anonymous reviewer for their careful revision of the manuscript, criticism and helpful comments. Dr Sean O'Keefe is thanked for his comments on *Camponotus*. James Riding is warmly thanked for his suggestions and editorial management. The Administración de Parques Nacionales of Argentina and the Administración de Lago Escondido are thanked for allowing us access to the outcrops. No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

Funding

This work was supported by grants from Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas (CONICET) and Secretaría General de Ciencia y Tecnología, Universidad Nacional del Sur (SEGCyT).

Notes on contributors



MARÍA VIRGINIA BIANCHINOTTI is a mycologist. She is a full professor in the Universidad Nacional del Sur (Argentina) and a scientific researcher of the Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas (CONICET). Her research is focused on the biology of minute ascomycetes from native plants and soils of Argentina. Her deep fascination with fungal biodiversity led her to become interested in

fossil fungi. Since 1998 has participated in multidisciplinary projects to study them.



MARCELO A. MARTÍNEZ is a research scientist at the Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas (CONICET) and a professor at the Geology Department of the Universidad Nacional del Sur (UNS), Bahía Blanca, Argentina. He received his Ph.D. in Geology in 1999 from the Universidad Nacional del Sur, Argentina. Marcelo's research has focused on palynofacies analysis and the palynostratigraphy

of Argentinian Mesozoic and Cenozoic sedimentary sequences.



M. ELINA CORNOU is a Ph.D. in Geology. She is currently a researcher at the Instituto Geológico del Sur - Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas (INGEOSUR-CONICET) and a professor at the Geology Department of the Universidad Nacional del Sur (UNS), Bahía Blanca, Argentina. Her research specialism, which she continues to pursue, is the palynology of the Paleogene-Early Neogene of

the Nirihuau Basin, Argentina.

ORCID

M. Virginia Bianchinotti ib http://orcid.org/0000-0002-8981-5841

References

- Alvin KL, Muir MD. 1970. An epiphyllous fungus from the Lower Cretaceous. Biological Journal of the Linnean Society. 2(1):55–59.
- Asensio M, Zavala C, Arcuri M. 2005. Los sedimentos terciarios del Río Foyel, provincia de Río Negro, Argentina [Tertiary sediments of the Foyel River, province of Río Negro, Argentina]. 16° Congreso Geológico Argentino, (La Plata), Actas, 271–276. Spanish.
- Bannister JM, Conran JG, Lee DE. 2016. Life on the phylloplane: Eocene epiphyllous fungi from Pikopiko Fossil Forest, Southland, New Zealand. New Zealand Journal of Botany. 54(4):412–432.
- Bradley WH. 1967. Two aquatic fungi (Chytridiales) of Eocene age from the Green River Formation of Wyoming. American Journal of Botany. 54:577–582.
- Clark WH, Prusso DC. 1986. *Desmidiospora myrmecophila* found infesting the ant *Camponotus semitestaceus*. Mycologia. 78(5):865–866.
- Conran JG, Bannister JM, Reichgelt T, Lee DE. 2016. Epiphyllous fungi and leaf physiognomy indicate an ever-wet humid mesothermal

(subtropical) climate in the late Eocene of southern New Zealand. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology. 452:1–10.

- Cornou ME. 2012. Palinoestratigrafía y Palinofacies del Eoceno medio–Oligoceno en la parte central de la Cuenca de Ñirihuau, Argentina [Palynostratigraphy and Palynofacies of the middle Eocene– Oligocene in the central part of the Ñirihuau Basin, Argentina]. Universidad Nacional del Sur, Bahía Blanca, p. 210.
- Cornou ME, Quattrocchio ME, Martínez MA. 2014. Palinoestratigrafía de la Formación Salto del Macho, Paleógeno de la Cuenca de Ñirihuau, Argentina [Palynostratigraphy of the Salto del Macho Formation, Palaeogene of the Ñirihuau Basin, Argentina]. Ameghiniana. 51(6): 556–571. Spanish.
- Dilcher DL. 1965. Epiphyllous fungi from Eocene deposits in western Tennessee, USA. Palaeontographica Abteilung B. 116:1–54.
- Diez O, Zubia M. 1981. Sinopsis estratigráfica de la región de El Bolsón, provincia de Río Negro [Stratigraphic synopsis of the El Bolsón area, Río Negro province]. Revista de la Asociación Geológica Argentina. 36:19–28. Spanish.
- Ediger VŞ, Alişan C. 1989. Tertiary fungal and algal palynomorph biostratigraphy of the northern Thrace basin, Turkey. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 58(2–4):139–161.
- Edwards WN. 1922. An Eocene Microthyriaceous fungus from Mull, Scotland. Transactions of the British Mycological Society. 8(1–2): 66–72.
- Ellis P. 1977. The genera *Trichothyrina* and *Actinopeltis* in Britain. Transactions of the British Mycological Society. 68(2):145–155.
- Elsik W, Dilcher D. 1974. Palynology and age of clays exposed in Lawrence Clay Pit, Henry County, Tennessee. Palaeontographica Abteilung B. 146:65–87.
- Elsik WC. 1980. The utility of fungal spores in marginal marine strata of the late Cenozoic northern Gulf of Mexico. In: Bharadwaj DC, Singh HP, Tiwari RS, editors. Proceedings of the 4th International Palynological Conference., Lucknow (1976–77) Vol 4, p. 436–443.
- Elsik WC. 1992. The morphology, taxonomy, classification and geologic occurrence of fungal palynomorphs. A short course presented under the Auspices of The American Association of Stratigraphic Palynologists, 26–28 February 1992. Houston (TX): Adam's Mark Hotel; p. 360.
- Ethridge Glass DL, Brown DD, Elsik WC. 1986. Fungal spores from the Upper Eocene Manning Formation, Jackson Group, east and south-central Texas, USA. Pollen et Spores. 28:403–420.
- Evans HC, Samson RA. 1984. *Cordyceps* species and their anamorphs pathogenic on ants (Formicidae) in tropical forest ecosystems II. The *Camponotus* (Formicinae) complex. Transactions of the British Mycological Society. 82(1):127–150.
- García Massini JG, Jacobs BF. 2011. The effects of volcanism on Oligocene-age plant communities from the Ethiopian Plateau, and implications for vegetational resilience in a heterogeneous landscape. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 164(3–4):211–222.
- García Massini J, Channing A, Guido DM, Zamuner AB. 2012. First report of fungi and fungus-like organisms from Mesozoic hot springs. Palaios. 27:55–62.
- González Bonorino F. 1973. Geología del área entre San Carlos de Bariloche y Llao-Llao. [Geology of the area between San Carlos de Bariloche and Llao-Llao]. Fundación Bariloche, Departamento de Recursos Naturales y Energía. Report Number 16; p. 1–53. Spanish.
- González Bonorino F, González Bonorino G. 1978. Geología de la región de San Carlos de Bariloche: Un estudio de las Formaciones Terciarias del Grupo Nahuel Huapi [Geology of the San Carlos de Bariloche region: A study of the Tertiary Formations of the Nahuel Huapi Group]. Revista de la Asociación Geológica Argentina. 3:175–210.
- Hawksworth DL. 2011. A new dawn for the naming of fungi: impacts of decisions made in Melbourne in July 2011 on the future publication and regulation of fungal names. MycoKeys. 1:7–20.
- Hawksworth DL, van Geel B, Wiltshire P. 2016. The enigma of the *Diporotheca* palynomorph. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 235:94–98.
- Head MJ. 1993. Dinoflagellates, sporomorphs, and other palynomorphs from the Upper Pliocene St. Earth Beds of Cornwall, southwestern England. Journal of Paleontology. 31:1–62.

- Hofmann TA. 2010. Plant parasitic Asterinaceae and Microthyriaceae from the Neotropics (Panama) [dissertation]. Frankfurt am Main: Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University.
- Hofmann TA, Piepenbring M. 2006. New records and host plants of flyspeck fungi from Panama. Fungal Diversity. 22:55–70.
- Hongsanan S, Sánchez-Ramírez S, Crous PW, Ariyawansa H, Zhao RL, Hyde KD. 2016. The evolution of fungal epiphytes. Mycosphere. 7(11): 1690–1712.
- Kalgutkar RM. 1993. Paleogene fungal palynomorphs from Bonnet Plume Formation, Yukon Territory. In Reynolds L, editor. Contributions to Canadian Paleontology. Geological Survey of Canada, Bulletin 444; p. 51–105. Ottawa, Ontario: Geological Survey of Canada.
- Kalgutkar RM. 1997. Fossil fungi from the lower Tertiary Iceberg Bay Formation, Eukeka Sound Group, Axel Heiberg Island, Northwest Territories, Canada. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 97(1–2): 197–226.
- Kalgutkar RM, Braman DR. 2008. Santonian to?Earliest Campanian (Late Cretaceous) fungi from the Milk River Formation, Southern Alberta. Palynology. 32(1):39–61.
- Kalgutkar RM, Jansonius J. 2000. Synopsis of fossil fungal spores, mycelia and fructifications. American Association of Stratigraphic Palynologists Contribution Series 39. Dallas (TX): AASP.
- Lange RT. 1976. Fossil epiphyllous 'germlings', their living equivalents and their palaeohabitat indicator value. Neues Jahrbuch für Geologie und Paläontologie. 151:142–165.
- Lange RT. 1978. Southern Australian Tertiary epiphyllous fungi. Modern equivalents in the Australasian region, and habitat indicator value. Canadian Journal of Botany. 56(5):532–541.
- Lange RT. 1980. Evidence of lid-cells and host-specific microfungi in the search for Tertiary *Eucalyptus*. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 29:29–33.
- Lange RT, Smith PH. 1971. The Maslin Bay flora, South Australia 3. Dispersed fungal spores. Neues Jahrbuch für Geologie und Paläontologie Monatschefte. 10:663–681.
- Lange RT, Smith PH. 1975. *Ctenosporites* and other Paleogene fungal spores. Canadian Journal of Botany. 53(11):1156–1157.
- Martínez MA, Bianchinotti MV, Saxena RK, Cornou ME, Quattrocchio ME. 2016. Fungal spores from the Palaeogene El Foyel Group of Ñirihuau Basin, Argentina. Papers in Palaeontology. 2(3):343–362.
- Miola A. 2012. Tools for Non-Pollen Palynomorphs (NPPs) analysis: a list of Quaternary NPP types and reference literature in English language (1972-2011). Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 186:142–161.
- Norris G. 1986. Systematic and stratigraphic palynology of Eocene to Pliocene strata in the Imperial Nuktak C-22 well, Mackenzie Delta region, District of Mackenzie, N.W.T. Bulletin of the Geological Survey of Canada. 340:89.
- Norris G. 1997. Paleocene-Pliocene deltaic to inner shelf palynostratigraphic zonation, depositional environments and Palaeoclimates in the Imperial Adgo F-28 well, Beaufort-Mackenzie Basin. Bulletin Geological Survey of Canada. 523:1–71.
- Nuñez Otaño N, di Pasquo M, Bianchinotti MV. 2017. The occurrence of Potamomyces palmarensis sp. nov. in the Late Holocene of El Palmar National Park (Colón, Entre Ríos, Argentina) and transfer of fossil species of Mediaverrunites to Potamomyces. Palynology. 41:267–277.
- O'Keefe J. 2017. Fungal palynomorphs from the Miocene Heath Formation, Tumbes Province, Perú. Palynology. 41(supplement): 309–326.
- Parsons MG. 2000. Palynology of Paleogene strata in the Caribou Hills, Beaufort-MacKenzie Basin, northern Canada [dissertation]. Department of Geology, University of Toronto, Canada.
- Phipps CJ, Rember WC. 2004. Epiphyllous fungi from the Miocene of Clarkia, Idaho: reproductive structures. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 129(1–2):67–79.
- Pirozynski KA. 1976. Fossil fungi. Annual Review of Phytopathology. 14(1):237–246.
- Pöthe de Baldis D. 1984. Microfloras fósiles cenozoicas [Cenozoic fossil microflora]. In: Ramos V, editor. Geología y recursos naturales de la provincia de Río Negro. Buenos Aires. 9° Congreso Geológico Argentino, (Bariloche), Relatorio 2(4):393–411. Spanish.

- Pound MJ, O'Keefe JMK, Nuñez Otaño NB, Riding JB. 2018. Three new Miocene fungal palynomorphs from the Brassington Formation, Derbyshire, UK. Palynology. 1–12. doi:10.1080/01916122.2018.1473300
- Quattrocchio M, Martínez MA, Asensio MA, Cornou ME, Olivera DE. 2012. Palynology of El Foyel Group (Paleogene), Ñirihuau Basin, Argentina. Revista Brasileira de Paleontologia. 15(1):67–84.
- Ramírez RA. 2004. Middle to Late Eocene dinoflagellate cysts and fungal spores from the East Coast of the Maracaibo Lake, Venezuela (Biostratigraphy, Palaeoecology and Taxonomy) [dissertation] Geowissenschaften Fakultätder Eberhard–Karls–Universität Tübingen; p. 145.
- Ravazzoli IA, Sesana FL. 1977. Descripción geológica de la Hoja 41c, Río Chico, provincia de Río Negro [Geological description of the Sheet 41c, Río Chico, province of Río Negro]. Servicio Geológico Nacional. Buenos Aires. Boletín. 148:1–80. Spanish.
- Ratanasthien B, Takashima I, Matsubaya O. 2008. Paleaogeography and climatic change recorded on Viviparidae carbon and oxygen isotope in Mae Moh coal mine, northern Thailand. Bulletin of the Geological Survey of Japan. 59(7–8):327–338.
- Romero EJ, Castro MT. 1986. Material fúngico y granos de polen de angiospermas de la Formación Río Turbio (Eoceno), provincia de Santa Cruz, República Argentina [Fungal material and pollen grains of angiosperms of the Río Turbio Formation (Eocene), province of Santa Cruz, Argentina]. Ameghiniana. 23:101–118.
- Saltamachia SJ. 2018. New observations and phylogeny of the entomopathogenic fungus *Desmidiospora myrmecophilia* [master's thesis]. University of Louisiana at Lafayette; p. 39.
- Seifert KA. 2017. When should we describe species? IMA Fungus. 8: BF03449459.
- Silva RS, Garcia MJ, Santos RA, De Oliveira PE, Giannini PCF, Bernardes-De-Oliveira MCE, Medeiros VB, Bistrichi CA, Fernandes RS, Raczka MF. 2015. O significado paleoambiental de palinomorfos de fungos em turfas quaternárias do médio vale do rio Paraíba do Sul, SP, Brasil [The paleoenvironmental significance of fungal palynomorphs in quaternary peatlands of the middle valley of the Paraíba do Sul river, SP, Brazil]. Revista do Instituto Geológico, São Paulo. 36:1–24. Portuguese.
- Shumilovskikh LS, Ferrer A, Schlütz F. 2017. Non-pollen palynomorphs notes: 2. Holocene record of *Megalohypha aqua-dulces*, its relation to the fossil form genus *Fusiformisporites* and association with lignicolous freshwater fungi. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 245: 167–176.
- Shumilovskikh LS, Schlütz F, Achterberg I, Bauerosche A, Leuschner HH. 2015. Non-pollen palynomorphs from mid-Holocene peat of the

raised bog Borsteler Moor (Lower Saxony, Germany). Studia Quaternaria. 32:5–18.

- Smith PH. 1980. Trichothyriaceous fungi from the Early Tertiary of southern England. Palaeontology. 23(1): 205–212.
- Smith PH. 1984. Fossil fungi from early Tertiary deposits of southern England [dissertation]. University of London.
- Thaxter R. 1891. On certain new or peculiar North American Hyphomycetes. II. *Helicocephalum, Gonatorrhodiella, Desmidiospora* nov. genera and *Everhartia lignatilis* n. sp. Botanical Gazette. 16(7): 201–205.
- Taylor TH, Krings M, Taylor ED. 2015. Fossil fungi. Amsterdam: Academic Press Elsevier.
- Traverse A. 2007. Paleopalynology. Dordrecht: Springer.
- Turland NJ, Wiersema JH, Barrie FR, Greuter W, Hawksworth DL, Herendeen PS, Knapp S, Kusber W-H, Li D-Z, Marhold K, et al. 2018. International Code of Nomenclature for algae, fungi, and plants (Shenzhen Code) adopted by the 19th International Botanical Congress Shenzhen, China, July 2017. Regnum Vegetabile 159. Glashütten: Koeltz Botanical Books.
- van Geel B. 1978. A palaeoecological study of Holocene peat bog sections in Germany and Netherlands, based on the analysis of pollen, spores and macro- and microscopic remains of fungi, algae, cormophytes and animals. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology. 25(1): 1–120.
- Vishnu (Nee Mandal) A, Khan MA, Bera M, Dilcher DL, Bera S. 2017. Fossil Asterinaceae in the phyllosphere of the eastern Himalayan Neogene Siwalikforest and their palaeoecological significance. Botanical Journal of the Linnean Society. 185:147–167.
- Volkheimer W, Melendi 1976. Palinomorfos como fósiles guía. Tercera parte: Técnicas de laboratorio palinológico. Revista Minera de Geología y Mineralogía. 34:119–130.
- Wells A, Hill R. 1993. Epiphyllous microorganisms as palaeoclimate estimators: the developmental sequence of fungal 'germlings' on their living host. Australian Systematic Botany. 6(5):377–386.
- Wingfield MJ, De Beer ZW, Slippers B, Wingfield BD, Groenewald JZ, Lombard L, Crous PW. 2012. One fungus, one name promotes progressive plant pathology. Molecular Plant Pathology. 13(6):604–613.
- Wilk M, Metrak M, Budziszewska J, Suska-Malawska M, Bulska E, Wrzosek M. 2012. Palaeoecological study of *Desmidiospora*-like fungus from poor fen in North-Eastern Poland. Proceedings of the 14th International Peat Congress, Extended Abstract 76.